

## ИСТОРИЯ И ИСТОЧНИКОВЕДЕНИЕ

UDC 82.39+761.1

**Interpretation of Novels and Plays about Song  
Dynasty Judge Bao in the Chinese Illustrated Woodblock  
Editions and Popular Prints *nianhua*\****E. A. Zavidovskaia*<sup>1,2</sup>, *T. I. Vinogradova*<sup>3</sup>, *D. I. Maiatskii*<sup>4</sup><sup>1</sup> Institute of Oriental Studies, Russian Academy of Sciences,  
12, ul. Rozhdestvenka, Moscow, 107031, Russian Federation<sup>2</sup> Bryansk State University,  
14, ul. Bezhitskaia, Bryansk, 241036, Russian Federation<sup>3</sup> Russian Academy of Sciences Library,  
1, Birzhevaia liniia, St. Petersburg, 199034, Russian Federation<sup>4</sup> St. Petersburg State University,  
7–9, Universitetskaya nab., St. Petersburg, 199034, Russian Federation

**For citation:** Zavidovskaia E. A., Vinogradova T. I., Maiatskii D. I. Interpretation of Novels and Plays about Song Dynasty Judge Bao in the Chinese Illustrated Woodblock Editions and Popular Prints *nianhua*. *Vestnik of Saint Petersburg University. Asian and African Studies*, 2021, vol. 13, issue 3, pp. 383–399. <https://doi.org/10.21638/spbu13.2021.306>

The article aims to analyze various illustrations of court case stories about Song dynasty judge Bao Zheng (包拯, also named as Bao-gong 包公, Bao Longtu 包龍圖, 999–1062), found in Qing woodblock editions of the novel and popular woodblock prints *nianhua*, in order to determine how tales about the famous incorruptible judge have been transformed in the visual culture of late imperial times. The authors discovered several woodblock editions of novels about Judge Bao-gong, or Bao Dragon-Design (Bao Longtu), in the St. Petersburg State University library including one illustrated edition and several non-illustrated ones. The State Hermitage and other Russian collections hold an impressive number of popular prints depicting scenes from the traditional drama based on Judge Bao stories, while only several of them refer directly to literary pieces, being mostly scenes from the plays. The protagonists are shown wearing theatrical make-up matching their theatrical character, Judge Bao is recognized by a black-colored face symbolizing his astuteness and uncorrupted nature. The article attempts to find connections between Shi Yukun's 石玉昆 novel "The Three Heroes and Five Gallants"

\* This study was funded by the Russian Foundation for Basic Research No. 19-59-52001 MHT\_a "Commerce, folk beliefs, arts on the traditional Chinese woodblock pictures from little studied collections of Russia and Taiwan".

© St. Petersburg State University, 2021

(*Sanxiawuyi* 三俠五義, 1879), the traditional drama plays and *nianhua* prints featuring Judge Bao, which proliferated in the late 19<sup>th</sup> — early 20<sup>th</sup> centuries. This research claims to define sources of various types of illustrations and clarify connections between book illustration, popular prints and drama.

*Keywords:* Judge Bao's stories, book illustration, play, popular print *nianhua*, Russian collection, martial scene.

## Introduction

In his introduction to the English translation of eight Ming dynasty chantefables (*cihua* 詞話) about Judge Bao Wilt L. Idema (born in 1944), an authority on Chinese popular literature, provides a detailed review of the research on Judge Bao as a historical and fictional figure [1, pp. ix-x]. Judge Bao (Bao-gong 包公, known also as Bao Zheng 包拯, Bao Qingtian 包青天, Bao Longtu 包龍圖 etc., 999–1062) was a politician who lived during Song dynasty. For a quarter of a century, he worked in the civil service and climbed the career ladder from a small county official to the very high post of regional governor for the capital city Kaifeng. He was always incredibly honest and fair and he was concerned about hardships of common Chinese people. In his struggle against corruption he faced the danger of revenge from aristocratic Chinese families, and even bravely challenged the most beloved concubine of the Renzong emperor 仁宗 (1022–1063). Later Bao Zheng became a legendary person and a hero of Chinese traditional theatre, popular literature and visual arts. There were chantefables, novels, theatric plays, illustrations and other art pieces throughout the centuries devoted to him. This is how he turned out to symbolize perfect justice in Chinese culture.

This study aims to determine how illustrations of Judge Bao's stories circulated in the late Qing society in order to properly interpret woodblock editions and prints found in the Russian collections, therefore we do not delve into its literary aspects. Since our scholarly lenses have been focused on visual aspects of late imperial cultural landscape, we checked both the illustrated books and popular prints to find that the number of popular prints with Judge Bao is slightly less than those depicting Qing dynasty judges Shi-gong 施公 and Peng-gong 彭公 — protagonists of chivalric court case sequel novels published in 1820 and 1871 respectively. This may be explained by the high popularity of martial plays featuring those two judges and their brave mates in the second part of the 19<sup>th</sup> century. Our research also aims to scrutinize the role of drama in the dissemination of Judge Bao's stories in late Qing China.

The court case stories of Judge Bao were popular with storytellers and actors, and they were adapted as ballads and stories, novels and plays starting from the Song dynasty [1, p. ix]. Without a doubt, deification of Judge Bao reinforced his position, as he was considered to hold office in the underworld's Court of Swift Retribution (*subao* 速報). In the early stages of Bao-gong's mythmaking process, he came to be associated with the courts of the netherworld, and in particular with the position of its King Yama (*Yanluowang* 閻羅王) [2, p. 39]. Judge Bao's stories enjoyed numerous republishing during Ming and Qing periods, e. g., "Court Cases of Dragon-Design" (*Longtugong'an* 龍圖公案)<sup>1</sup>, an early

<sup>1</sup> Dragon-Design was one of Judge Bao's nicknames. It is mainly seen in ballads or plays — such as "Zhamei'an" 劉美案, "Limaohuan taizi" 狸貓換太子 etc. He received it after the Renzong emperor granted him the title of an *zhixueshi* official of the Dragon-Design pavilion (*Longtugezhi xueshi* 龍圖閣直學士).

17<sup>th</sup> century 100-chapter novel by An Yushi 安遇時, enjoyed 32 editions during the Ming and Qing periods [3, p. 65]. In its earliest editions, this work contained 100 cases, but the 19<sup>th</sup> century reprints often limited the number of cases to 72, 62 or 58 [1, p. xv]. Therefore, would it be feasible to suggest that Judge Bao was less presented in popular prints, but more in the woodblock editions compared to Judges Shi and Peng due to a difference in audiences? This research intends to clarify this issue.

## Images of Judge Bao in book illustration

The earliest illustrated woodblock edition of chant fables, or “ballad-stories for narrating and singing” *shuochang cihua* 說唱詞話, by Beijing’s printing house Yongshuntang 永順堂 containing eight stories about Judge Bao is dated by Chenghua 成化 era (1465–1488) of the Ming dynasty. In this edition, a full page or half of the page was occupied by an illustration — a so-called ‘picture on the top, text on the bottom’ *shangtu xiawen* 上圖下文<sup>2</sup> (Fig. 1). Another illustrated edition “Bao Dragon-Design adjudicates one hundred court cases” (*Baolongtu pan baijiagong’an* 包龍圖判百家公案) with similar *shangtuxiawen* design has been printed by a Fujian printing shop *Yugengtang* 與畊堂 during the Wanli era<sup>3</sup> (1594, housed at the Hōsa Bunko 蓬佐文庫, Japan, Fig. 2). James St. André from the Chinese University of Hong Kong concludes that “spatially, the *Baijia gong’an* illustrations quickly establish as the norm the diagonal division which cuts from the upper left to the



Fig. 1. First page of Ming dynasty Yunshuntang edition. Available at: <https://www.shanghaimuseum.net/mu/frontend/pg/index> (accessed: 10.02.2021)

<sup>2</sup> Reprint details: 明成化說唱詞話叢刊, 北京市: 文物出版社出版, 1979.

<sup>3</sup> Patrick Hanan associates the appearance of this edition with “a small publishing boom in court case fiction during the two or three decades of that span the year 1600” [5, p. 302].



Fig. 2. Baijiagong'an 百家公案 edition (1594) [4, p. 64]

lower right, establishing a privileged space in the upper-right hand corner with narrative action taking place from upper-right to lower left, as with the text printed below it ...it also consistently places objects and/or people of higher status in the upper right and those with lower status in the lower left" [4, p. 54]. This method of illustration was gradually replaced by *xiuxiang* 繡像 portraits of the protagonists placed in the first volume of the novel. The collection of stories "Court Cases of Dragon-Design" (*Longtu gong'an* 龍圖公案) by An Yushi enjoyed dozens of editions during the Ming and Qing periods. The presence of this edition in the St. Petersburg State University library (Oriental department, Xyl. 771) may point to its wide circulation in the late Qing society. The Qing's period full 100-chapter editions include: large letter illustrated edition by *Simeitang* 四美堂 (1775, stored at the Dalian Library), which was reproduced by *Yuyutang* 兩余堂 (1716, Tianjin library), enlarged by *Zengmeitang* 增美堂 (1810) and *Yijingtang* 一經堂 (1816, Fig. 3); editions by *Wubentang* 務本堂, *Zaowentang* 藻文堂, *Jingwentang* 經文堂 are dated by 1808; there are also editions by *Sanrangtang* 三讓堂 (1809), *Guiwentang* 貴文堂 (1821), *Weijingtang* 維經堂 (1868), *Jimozhuang* 即墨莊 (1874).



Fig. 3. Illustration from Yijingtang (1816) edition.  
Available at: <https://journals.openedition.org/ideo/339?file=1> (accessed: 10.02.2021)



Fig. 4. Illustration from Wenhualou edition,  
St. Petersburg State University library,  
Xyl. 771

Abridged editions of the “Court Cases of Dragon-Design” with 62 chapters include: the *Shuyetang* 書業堂 edition (1775, Liaoning library) and an illustrated 1802 edition (Japan), copied by *Lizhaolou* 黎照樓 in 1843, another edition by *Sanshetang* 三社堂 is dated to 1849 [6, p 27,7, p. 683]. The edition “Cases of Dragon Seal Judge” in 8 *juan* (*Longtu gong'an baajuan* 龍圖公案八卷) by the *Wenhualou* 文華樓<sup>4</sup> printing house held at the St. Petersburg State University library (Xyl. 771) has ten illustrations in the front part of the first *juan*. Illustrations from this edition, if compared to those from the above mentioned 1594 edition (Fig. 2), display an obvious degradation of the accuracy and refinement of the Qing edition’s pictures (Fig. 4). The scene of Judge Bao presiding in the courtroom seems to be a standard way of depicting his figure in the Qing editions (Fig. 3, 4), while similarities between illustrations of other stories are in question.

The novel “The Three Heroes and Five Gallants” (*Sanxiawuyi* 三俠五義, 1879)<sup>5</sup> is based on “A Record by Ear of the Tale of Dragon-Design” *Longtuerlu* 龍圖耳錄 (a transcription of the oral story cycle, which only circulated as a manuscript), and “presents a compilation on the basis of the prosimetrical narratives on the adventures of Judge Bao and his underlings by the mid-19<sup>th</sup> century Beijing performer Shi Yukun’s

<sup>4</sup> This edition along with those by *Tiandetang* 天德堂, *Jingshutang* 敬書堂, *Jingyuantang* 經元堂, *Liangyutang* 兩余堂, *Yizhitang* 益智堂 are mentioned as non-dated ones [7, p.683].

<sup>5</sup> The Russian translation by V.A.Panasiuk (1924–1990) was published in 1974 with B.L. Riftin’s (1932–2012) preface and commentaries. The second edition was published in 2000 [9].

石玉昆 and his followers” [1, p. xxii]. “By the middle of the nineteenth century, the figure of the Magistrate Pao has become incorporated into a story cycle, which involved a group of heroes and gallants who allied themselves with Magistrate Pao in his search for justice” [8, p. 3]. This novel has combined dispersed Bao-gong stories into a coherent narrative. It is believed that an auspicious popular print depicting a cat chasing a butterfly inspired Shi Yukun with the idea to invent two protagonists for his novel — an Imperial Cat Zhanzhao 展昭 chasing another one, a weasel and a libertine named Motley Butterfly *Huahudie* 花蝴蝶 [9, p. 6–7]. The first printed edition of the novel was produced with use of the movable letters *huozi* 活字 technique by Beijing’s *Juzhentang* 聚珍堂 in 1879, followed by 1882 “movable letters” edition copied by *Wenyatang* 文雅堂 (1883) and *Baoxingtang* 寶興堂 (1884) [6, p. 28].

The early 19<sup>th</sup> century novel “Tower of Myriad Flowers” (*wanhualou* 萬花樓) enjoyed numerous editions, one of the early illustrated ones was printed by *Changqingtang* 長慶堂 (1814), St. Petersburg State University library holds two non-illustrated editions: 1) Xyl. 271, “Popular Tale from the Tower of Myriad Flowers in sixty eight chapters” (*Wanhualou yanyi liushibahui* 萬花樓演義六十八回, full title: Newly cut xylographic edition about Song Judge Bao. Early Story of Di Qing in 14 *juan* and 68 chapters *Xinjuan houxunanbei song baogong diqing chuzhuan shiliujuan shibahui* 新鑄後續南北宋包公狄青初傳十四卷六十八回); 2) Xyl. 728, “Later Sequel of the First Tale about generals Yang family and about Star patrons of civil and military service Bao-gong and Di Qing in 14 *juan* and 68 chapters” *Houxu dasong yangjiajiang wenwuquxing baogongdiqing chuzhuan shiqijuanshiba hui* 後續大宋楊家將文武曲星包公狄青初傳十四卷六十八回).

As will be shown below, this novel has also inspired theatre troupes to create plays with martial scenes, which appeared on popular prints.

### Judge Bao as a character of the plays in popular prints

Wilt L. Idema stresses that all the Yuan and early Ming plays in which Judge Bao plays a substantive role have been preserved in manuscripts and printed editions of the late 16<sup>th</sup> and early 17<sup>th</sup> centuries. The texts passed through the Ming imperial palace. These plays for most of the Ming dynasty were kept in the palace and only became available to a wider audience when the 17<sup>th</sup> century compendia of Judge Bao stories already enjoyed wide circulation [1, p. xiv–xv, xvi]. During the Ming and Qing periods, Judge Bao appeared in *chuanqi* 傳奇 plays, he obtained a fixed stage make-up by the Ming period — a black face symbolizing justice and incorruptibility with white lines extending from the wings of the nose, a white crescent moon on his forehead *yueyaer* 月牙兒 pointing at his power over spirits since Judge Bao was often featured as a judge of the hell court. In popular prints Judge Bao was traditionally depicted in theatrical attire as an elderly man, *laosheng* 老生, character wearing a robe with a ‘single dragon’ *dulong* 獨龍 on it.

The impressive number of popular prints proves that Judge Bao appears as a play character much more often than Qing dynasty Judges Shi and Peng, who mostly disappeared from the prints and were replaced with their mates — errand knights (Huang Tianba 黃天霸 etc.). Can this be explained by the fact that most of the plays (referring to the Peking opera) illustrated by the prints were produced on the basis of the Ming novel “Bao Dragon-Design adjudicates one hundred court cases” and emerged prior to

the publication of Shi Yukun's novel "The Three Heroes and Five Gallants" in 1879? In order to trace such connotations, in this study we attempt to categorize prints related to Judge Bao as deriving from Shi Yukun's novel and its sequels and those which could also spring from other sources, such as Ming dynasty *cihua* or other Qing novels.

### *Prints related to Shi Yukun's novel*

According to Tao Junqi, eighteen out of thirty-nine Peking opera plays about Judge Bao and his allies bear a close resemblance with Shi Yukun's novel "The Three Heroes and Five Gallants" [10, p.228–238]. Notably, we have come across several prints illustrating Shi Yukun's novel, which do not feature Judge Bao, but show his mates displaying miracles of vigor [11, p.137]. The print from the State Hermitage LT-5260<sup>6</sup> "The Three Heroes and Five Gallants Arrest Deng Che" (*Sanxiawuyi zhuona dengche* 三俠五義捉拿鄧車, Fig. 5) fully demonstrates the tendency of Judge Bao not appearing in the martial scene prints. Deng Che 鄧車 is shown as an elderly warrior *laosheng* 老生 wearing a headdress with pheasant feathers (also a symbol of a barbarian general), captured by another elderly warrior Bei Xia 北俠. The episode from chapters 66–67 of Shi Yukun's novel was turned into a Peking opera play "Motley Butterfly" (*Hua hudie* 花蝴蝶).

Deng Che, "a genius of the bow", was a person of dubious moral standards. He is often present in the prints, e. g., print LT-3690 "Deng Che steals a stamp" (*Dengche dao yin* 鄧車盜印, produced at *Wanxingrui* 萬興瑞 shop, Yangliuqing) shows the first of his two attempts to steal an important seal, which ended in failure. He was later captured and punished by the Five Righteous. Both prints (Fig. 5 and LT-3690) refer to the Peking opera play "Motley Butterfly". A similar martial scene of Deng Che fighting with Bai Yutang 白玉堂 is shown taking place in the yard (LT-5261). Here, we may notice a certain inconsistency in Deng Che's make-up, dress and headdress style seen in popular prints and



Fig. 5. "The Three Heroes and Five Gallants Arrest Deng Che", LT-5260. © The State Hermitage Museum, St. Petersburg, 2021

<sup>6</sup> All the prints from the State Hermitage mentioned in the paper can be viewed on-line by entering their number into the search box of the museum's on-line catalogue, "LT" should be replaced by "JIT" to conduct a proper image search: <http://collections.hermitage.ru/>.



Fig. 6. Deng Che on a print in Imperial Album. Available at: <https://www.xshouyi.com/6534.html> (accessed: 10.02.2021)



Fig. 7. “The Tale about Loyal Five Small Righteous”, LT-5267. © The State Hermitage Museum, St. Petersburg, 2021

in the imperial palace album of actors. In print LT-5260, the main color in his make-up is purple (combined with black and white lines indicating facial features), he wears a green patterned costume, red trousers and multicolor headdress with pheasant feathers. In print LT-3690, his make-up has a green basis (supplemented with a red pattern on the forehead, black and white lines indicating facial features), he is dressed in purple patterned cloths, purple headdress and red trousers. The third version (where his make-up was supposed to have three blots of red color on his forehead, he wears a green skirt, red robe, green headdress) may be seen in the album titled “Praising the Ascending Peace” (慶賞昇平 *Qingshang shengping*, 1851–1874). It was produced by the Bureau of Ascending Peace (昇平署 *Shengpingshu*, est.1827), which was in charge of imperial opera performances, and it features portraits of several characters from Shi Yukun’s novel including Deng Che (Fig. 6)<sup>7</sup>. It can be assumed that the folk prints reflected changes in the make-up and clothing of the character that occurred from one play to another.

Print LT-5267 “Five Small Righteous Smash Xiafeng Peak” (*Xiaowuyi dapo xiafengshan* 小五義打破夾峰山) illustrates a scene from chapter 93 of the sequel titled “The Tale about Loyal Five Small Righteous” (*Zhonglie xiaowuyi zhuan* 忠烈小五義傳, or “Small Five Righteous” *Xiaowuyi* 小五義, Fig. 7) published in 1890. Figures in theatrical attire and make-up are shown in a natural setting, in the center is an Imperial Cat (*yumian mao* 玉面貓) in human form with two swords, who was a former bandit of Xiafeng peak turned loyal servant to the authorities. The Imperial Cat is being attacked by the Small Five Virtuous, Judge Bao is not depicted in the print.

The print “Arresting Motley Butterfly” (*Zhuona huahudie* 捉拿花蝴蝶, LT-5265) is a classic example of a popular print reflecting the stage performance of the play “Motley

<sup>7</sup> The *Shengpingshua* archives hold records about the plays performed at the court and about 14 different Judge Bao plays were performed between 1870 and 1898, the same repertoire was staged in 1911 [12, p. 126]. The plays “Beating up the imperial robe” (Da longpao 打龙袍), “Case of guillotined Mei” (*Zhamei'an* 錮美案, other titles “Qin Xianglian” 秦香蓮, “Case solved by wise judge” *Minggongduan* 明公斷), “Guillotined Bao Mian” (*Zhabaomian* 錮包勉) were staged at the imperial court during the Guangxu era (1875–1908) and were a product of the famous “four Anhui troupes” [13, p. 345].



Butterfly”, where chairs and tables are used as basic props. V.M. Alekseev’s teacher Tian Ziru 田自如 has left a hand-written note describing this print<sup>8</sup>: “After Deng Che’s arrest, the great robber Motley Butterfly continued robbery alone, and male and female knights decided to capture him to pacify the area”. Such a concise description may represent common knowledge of the plot among the general public, but not of the theatre connoisseur who is more familiar with the play.

### *Prints of other popular plays featuring Judge Bao*

Shi Yukun’s novel encompassed a famous story about the Song dynasty emperor Renzong recognizing his exiled mother, which was borrowed from the Ming dynasty *cihua* “Renzong recognizes his mother” (*Renzong renmu zhuan* 仁宗認母傳), the story also appeared in the Ming novel “Court Cases of Dragon-Design”. Zhenzong’s (997–1022) consort Li Chen 李宸 was slandered by the empress Liu-hou 劉后 and driven out of the palace. Li Chen’s son grew up and became emperor Renzong. Judge Bao learned about the real identity of Li Chen and brought her back to the palace, where the emperor recognized his mother. The Yangliuqing print “Renzong recognizes his mother at the Nanqing palace” (*Nanqinggong renzong renmu* 南清宮仁宗認母) presents the final scene of the story without Judge Bao’s presence in the picture [LT-5292, Fig. 8, 14, ill. 103]. The State Hermitage holds two identical sheets (LT-5292, LT-5293) and a closer examination suggests that three prints were made with the same board, but on different paper. We propose that these prints illustrate a scene from the novel, but not a play since the characters are without theatrical make-up.

This story served as a plotline for the Peking opera play “Beating up the Dragon Robe” (*Da longpao* 打龍袍). An abundance of prints with this plot may be explained by the high popularity of the play, which may have been considered rather bold since upon Li Chen’s demand to punish her impious son, emperor Renzong, Judge Bao found away out — he beat the emperor’s gown with a stick. Shi Yukun’s novel does not contain this scene, which only appears in the play. Print No. LT-6009 from Yangliuqing portrays the apex scene of punishing Song Renzong’s imperial robe instead of him personally (Fig. 9).

A similar composition illustrating the scene from the play “Beating up the Dragon Robe” is found in the print with the mark of *Dexinghuadian* 德興畫店 shop (LT-6008, Fig. 10<sup>9</sup>), in which Judge Bao is holding a stick ready to beat the robe. This print is most likely a Shanghai copy of the sheet from Yangliuqing (LT-5319), proving that Shanghai tended to copy Yangliuqing pictures. As a result, it can be concluded that the play was

<sup>8</sup> Saint Petersburg brunch of the RAS archive holds V.M. Alekseev’s file, Fund 820, register 1, item No. 479a, sheet 89 (No. 1366).

<sup>9</sup> The note glued to the right fringe of print LT-3684 proves that Alekseev’s teachers do not always describe the plot of the play, but rather the clothing of the characters identified as “generals” and “female warriors”. V.M. Alekseev’s file from the Saint-Petersburg brunch of the RAS archive Fund 820, register 1, item No. 479a includes three descriptions of the story about Renzong recognizing his mother written by one of Alekseev’s Chinese mentors: 1) sheet 181 (also marked No. 559) matches print LT-5319 and mentions this play as being ‘frequently performed’; 2) sheets 51-52 (No. 457) match LT-5292 and mention that the depicted episode precedes the story with beating the imperial robe, the description is done with much detail; 3) sheet 92 (No. 1342) tells the story of beating the imperial robe in less detail. An abundance of such descriptive notes serves as additional proof of the play’s popularity.



Fig. 8. “Renzong recognizes his mother at the Nanqing palace”, LT-5292. © The State Hermitage Museum, St. Petersburg, 2021



Fig. 9. “Beating up the Dragon Robe”, LT-6009. © The State Hermitage Museum, St. Petersburg, 2021



Fig. 10. “Beating up the Dragon Robe”, LT-6008. © The State Hermitage Museum, St. Petersburg, 2021

popular in the Yangtze river area as well. Yangliuqing's *Lishengxing laohuadian* 李盛興老畫店 shop produced a print featuring another scene from the "Beating up the Dragon Robe", in which Judge Bao checks whether the old blind woman is really the former palace concubine Li Chen by asking her to determine the rank of the official by touching his hat [kept at the Geographical Society, 14, ill. 102]. Despite the fact that Judge Bao plays a minor role, he is painted standing next to the Renzong emperor, which may be explained by the tight connection between the Judge and the Song emperor in the commoners' imagination. Nevertheless, it remains difficult to clearly determine whether or not the play "Beating up the imperial robe" became popular due to the publication of Shi Yukun's novel.

Another episode telling about Judge Bao beating the emperor's attribute called "Beating the emperor's chariot" (*Da luanjia* 打鑾駕) was borrowed by Shi Yukun from the Ming "One hundred court cases" *Baijia gongan* 百家公案 (originally a *cihua*), whose original version was a Yuan period drama "Selling Rice at Chenzhou" (*Chenzhou tiaomi* 陳州糶米), it appears in chapter 9 of Shi Yukun's novel. It, subsequently, was turned into a Peking opera play with the same title<sup>10</sup>. The State Museum of Oriental Art (Moscow) houses print No. 29333KII [15, p. 63] with a stage scene from this play depicting the judge performing a beating gesture as a smart way to avoid being blamed for a serious crime.

We found a number of sheets titled "In Five Color Cave hard to differentiate the real and the fake" (*Wuhuadong zhenjia nanbian* 五花洞真假難變), which illustrate a scene from the Peking opera "Five Color Cave" (*Wuhuadong* 五花洞) that was rather popular in the first half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century and compiled by the actor Hu Xilu 胡喜祿 of Chuntai troupe 春臺班. The plot was borrowed from the play "Moving to a new place and luring out one's wife" (*Banchang guaiqi* 搬場拐妻), included in the Qianlong era collection of plays "White fox coat patched together" (*Zhuibaiqiu* 綴白裘, ed. by Wanhuazhuren 玩花主人). Only the episode of the couple moving to another place has remained in Peking opera. The prints present a non-fighting scene where both real and fake Judge Bao and Celestial Master Zhang are shown in the process of a trial in order to differentiate a real couple from demons who begot their appearance. All the protagonists are marked whether they are real or fake, fake Judge Bao has a white face, while the real Judge Bao has a black face. It is easy to notice that sheet No. LT-5051 (Fig. 11) from Shanghai is basically identical to sheet No. 649 from Kaifeng [housed at the Peterhof Palace Museum, Oranienbaum Branch, 15, p. 399], both were acquired by V.M. Alekseev.

The Peter the Great Museum of Anthropology and Ethnography of the Russian Academy of Sciences (MAE RAS) holds triptych print MAЭ No. 3676-201\_1 (Fig. 12) produced in Weixian county 濰縣, Shandong, its central part is similar to Fig. 11 and No. 649 from Kaifeng<sup>11</sup>. On the left panel, a scene from the play "Case of guillotined Mei" (*Zhamei'an* 鏹美案) is depicted, in which Chen Shimei 陳世美 is sentenced to death by Judge Bao for abandoning his wife Qin Xianglian. The story originally appeared in a Ming novel and was borrowed by Shi Yukun.

<sup>10</sup> Chen Tao mentions that this play was not performed at the court theatre [12, p. 126].

<sup>11</sup> An old photograph presenting a scene from this play featuring the famous Peking opera actor Mei Lanfang 梅蘭芳 performing Pan Jinlian and a boy featuring the dwarf Wu Dalang (1913) is reminiscent, in composition, of the prints discussed above. URL: <http://www.meilanfang.com.cn/index/show/id/229.html> (accessed: 30.12.2020).



Fig. 11. "Five Color Cave", LT-5051. © The State Hermitage Museum, St. Petersburg, 2021



Fig. 12. "Five Color Cave", MAE № 3676-201\_1

At the turn of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, Shanghai print shops produced calendars *yuefenpai* 月份牌, which reproduced the stories and plays popular among the general population at that time. For instance, a "Calendar with full version of A tree that sheds coins when shaken" (*Yaoqianshu quanben yuefenpai* 摇钱树全本月份牌) by *Jiuhezhai* 久和齋 shop (1909, LT-4876, Fig. 13) illustrates a story about Judge Bao. Alekseev's mentor (most likely Tian Ziru 田自如) wrote the following description for it: "Since people from the South do not make offerings to the Stove God, this calendar is different from those in the North... in the times of Song's Renzong there was a female goblin, the Forth Sister Zhang, who spit around venomous vapors and created lots of trouble, Judge Bao used a mirror to expel evil spirits to subjugate her and the peace was restored, on the bottom is a story of two men splitting the family fortune, in the center is some creature, but not a person. The picture



Fig. 13. “Calendar with full version of A tree that sheds coins when shaken”, LT-4876. © The State Hermitage Museum, St. Petersburg, 2021

has an auspicious meaning of wishing the customer wealth and longevity”<sup>12</sup>. Apparently, the author of these lines did not identify correctly the Peking opera play “A tree that sheds coins when shaken” (*Yaoqianshu* 搖錢樹), which tells the story of subjugating the Jade Emperor’s daughter, the Forth Sister Zhang (*Zhang sijie* 張四姐), driven down to the mundane world. The top scene shows her being sucked inside a spirit catching bottle (but not with Judge Bao’s mirror), the bottom scene depicts the Landlord Wang (*Wangyuanwai* 王員外) suspecting the Forth Sister Zhang and her husband of stealing a magic tree that sheds coins. Originally, this story appeared in a long lost *chuanqi* play “Heavenly cause”

<sup>12</sup> Saint Petersburg brunch of the RAS archive Fund 820, register 1, item No. 479a, sheet 84 (No. 1069). We should acknowledge that the view of Stove God cult seen by this Chinese gentleman is erroneous.

(*Tianyuanji* 天緣記) by an unknown Qing author. The calendar presents a case of the story expressing a wish for wealth.

### *Prints with Judge Bao from other novels*

The above-mentioned Qing period novel “Tower of Myriad Flowers” (*Wanhualou* 萬花樓, or “The First Tale of the Literary and Martial Stars Lord Bao and Di Qing of Great Song” *Dasong yangjiajiang wenwuquxing baogong diqing chuzhuan* 大宋楊家將文武曲星包公狄青初傳), by Li Yutang 李雨堂 merged the stories about Judge Bao with tales about the Song dynasty family of Yang military officials and warriors. In this novel, Judge Bao is depicted as the incarnation of the Asrtal God of Civil Arts (*Wenquxing* 文曲星), while another protagonist — famous Northern Song warrior Di Qing 狄青 (1008–1057) — as the Astral God of Military Arts (*Wuquxing* 武曲星). The prints display the popularity of the martial scenes involving Di Qing. Eliasberg’s catalogue of the prints, acquired by E. Chavannes during his journey with M. V. Alekseev in 1907, has the print “Di Qing defeats Wang Tianlu in a battle with an ax” (*Diqing biwu daopiwang tianlu* 狄青比武刀劈王天祿) [17, p. 42], identical to the one acquired by Alekseev (LT-4643, Fig. 14). It is a scene from the Peking opera “A wedding at the capital” (*Jing yuyuan* 京遇緣). The plot is as follows: Renzong’s father-in-law Pang Yuan 龐元 hated the talented young man Di Qing and created obstacles on his way of career growth. He set up a fight between Qi Ding and his relative Han Tianhua 韓天化 (on the print his name is Wang Tianlu). Di Qing won, but was sentenced to death by the emperor, Judge Bao’s intercession saved his life. The print follows the “southern school” tradition, present in the Suzhou-Hangzhou area, where the action is depicted in two plans — one shows a battle on horseback, another — with Renzong sitting on the throne and Judge Bao is at his left hand. The print LT-5600 by Shanghai shop *Jiuhezhai* 久和齋 (acquired by Alekseev in Suzhou) appears to be a copy of LT-4643 (Fig. 14).

Most likely Di Qing’s martial skills gave the novel “Tower of Myriad Flowers” its popularity, which resulted in a sequel “Five Tigers Pacify the West” (*Wuhu pingxi* 五虎平西)



Fig. 14. “Di Qing defeats Wang Tianlu in a battle with an ax”. LT-4643. © The State Hermitage Museum, St. Petersburg, 2021

by an unknown author. Consequently, a number of plays were staged, e. g., print “Di Qing steals a treasure” (*Diqing daobao* 狄青盜寶, LT-3812, *Yongxingdian* 永興店, Yangliuqing) presents a scene from the Peking opera “A princess of Double Yang” (*Shuangyang gongzhu* 雙陽公主) where Di Qing is shown dragging a precious banner of the western state Liao 遼 back to Song. Print LT-4765 by the famous Yangliuqing shop [Dai] *Lianzeng* 戴連增 presents flying tiger Liu Qing helping Di Qing, it is a scene from the Peking opera “Sea abyss” (*Haitong gou* 海通沟).

## Conclusion

This article has taken the genre of court case stories about Judge Bao as a subject reflected both in late imperial illustrated editions and popular prints *nianhua*. Woodblock editions about Judge Bao also widely circulated in the late Qing society, and Judge Bao plays became a source of inspiration for popular prints. We have discovered the key role of traditional opera as the medium through which a wider illiterate public learnt about court case stories about Judge Bao. We did not trace direct links between the composition of book illustrations and those of popular prints and suggest that artisans followed their own patterns in designing the composition of the prints. The work shows the important role of Shi Yukun’s novel “The Three Heroes and Five Gallants” (1879), which borrowed episodes from Song and Ming Judge Bao stories, many of them were turned into Peking opera plays and gained popularity. However, the case of the play “Beating up the Dragon Robe” shows that they did not always copy stories from the novels. Besides Shi Yukun’s novel, the Qianlong era collection of plays “White fox coat patched together”, *chuanqi* play “Heavenly cause” and Li Yutang’s novel “Tower of Myriad Flowers” provided plots for Peking opera plays with Judge Bao. Many sheets from the State Hermitage prove that sequels of Shi Yukun’s novel (e. g. “The Tale about Loyal Five Small Righteous”) and Li Yutang’s novel (e. g. “Five Tigers Pacify the West”) served as a source of inspiration for artisans, who often chose martial scenes for their pictures. It can be concluded that the interplay between novels and plays featuring Judge Bao produced a fertile soil for the emergence of an impressive amount of imagery and visual artifacts.

## References

1. Idema W.L. *Judge Bao and the Rule of Law: Eight Ballad-stories from the Period 1250–1450*. Singapore, World Scientific, 2010. 417 p.
2. Noga Ganany. Baogong as King Yama in the Literature and Religious Worship of Late-Imperial China. *Asia Major*, Vol. 28, No. 2 (2015), pp. 39–75.
3. Hegel R. E. *Reading Illustrated Fiction in Late Imperial China*. Stanford, Stanford University Press, 1988. 484 p.
4. St. André J. Picturing Judge Bao in Ming Shangtuxiawen Fiction. *Chinese Literature: Essays, Articles, Reviews*(CLEAR). Vol. 24 (2002.12), pp. 43–73.
5. Hanan P. Judge Bao’s Hundred Cases Reconstructed. *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies*, Vol. 40, no. 2 (1980), pp. 301–323.
6. Wang Xianghua. Lüelun “sanxiawuyi” banben de liubian [Brief discussion of the transformations of ‘The Three Heroes and Five Gallants’]. *Wenxue yanjiu*, 2005, no. 9, pp. 27–28. (In Chinese)
7. Liu Yeqiu ed. *Zhongguo gudian xiaoshuo da cidian* [Big Dictionary of Chinese classical novel]. Shijiazhuang: Hebei renmin chubanshe, 1998. 1391 p. (In Chinese)
8. Blader S.R. *A Critical study of “San-hsia wu-yi” and Relationship to the “Lung-t’u kung-an” song-book*. PhD Diss. 1977. 300p.

9. Shi Yukun. *The Three Heroes and Five Gallants. A Novel*. Moscow, Gud'yal-press, 2000. 352p. (In Russian)
10. Tao Junqi. *Jingjujumu chutan* [Preliminary discussion of Peking opera librettos]. Beijing, Zhongguo jixu chubanshe, 1963. 558 p. (In Chinese)
11. Vinogradova T. I. Judge Bao plots in various genres of Chinese popular art. *Proceedings of the XX-VII conference "Society and State in China"*. Moscow, 1996, pp. 137–140. (In Russian)
12. Chen Tao. *Baogongxi yanjiu* [Study of Judge Bao plays]. Beijing, Renmin chubanshe, 2011. 280 p. (In Chinese).
13. Yang Xurong. *Baijia gong'an yanjiu* [Study of One hundred court cases abdicated]. Shanghai, Shanghai guji chubanshe, 2005. 480 p. (In Chinese)
14. Riffin B. L., Wang Shucun. *Rare Chinese popular pictures from the Soviet collections*. Moscow, Aurora Publ.; Beijing, Renmin yishu chubanshe, 1991. 212 p. (In Russian)
15. *Chinese popular picture. Exhibition catalogue*. Ed. L. I. Kuzmenko. Moscow, 1987. 79 p. (In Russian)
16. *Zhongguo tuban nianhua jicheng. Eluosi zangpin juan* [Compendia of the Chinese woodblock new year pictures. Volume from the Russian collections], Feng Jicai ed. Beijing, Zhonghua shuju, 2009, 1009 p. (in Chinese)
17. Eliasberg D. *Imagerie Populaire Chinoise du Nouvel An. Arts asiatiques*, tome 35, Paris, 1978. 127 p.

Received: March 23, 2021

Accepted: June 24, 2021

Authors' information:

*Ekaterina A. Zavidovskaia* — PhD in Philology; katushaza@yahoo.com

*Tatiana I. Vinogradova* — PhD in History; ptat-vinogradova2008@yandex.ru

*Dmitry I. Maiatskii* — PhD in Philology; d.mayatsky@spbu.ru

## Интерпретация образа судьи Бао-гуна в иллюстрированных ксилографах и на китайской народной картине *няньхуа*\*

*Е. А. Завидовская*<sup>1,2</sup>, *Т. И. Виноградова*<sup>3</sup>, *Д. И. Маяцкий*<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Институт востоковедения РАН,

Российская Федерация, 107031, Москва, ул. Рождественка, 12

<sup>2</sup> Брянский государственный университет,

Российская Федерация, 241036, Брянск, ул. Бежицкая, 14

<sup>3</sup> Библиотека Российской академии наук,

Российская Федерация, 199034, Санкт-Петербург, Биржевая линия, 1

<sup>4</sup> Санкт-Петербургский государственный университет,

Российская Федерация, 199034, Санкт-Петербург, Университетская наб., 7–9

**Для цитирования:** *Zavidovskaia E. A., Vinogradova T. I., Maiatskii D. I.* Interpretation of Novels and Plays about Song Dynasty Judge Bao in the Chinese Illustrated Woodblock Editions and Popular Prints *nianhua* // Вестник Санкт-Петербургского университета. Востоковедение и африканистика. 2021. Т. 13. Вып. 3. С. 383–399. <https://doi.org/10.21638/spbu13.2021.306>

Анализируется иллюстративный материал к судебным повестям и романам о неподкупном сунском судье Бао Чжэне (包拯, 999–1062) из цинских ксилографических изданий и народной картины *няньхуа*, с тем чтобы проследить пути трансформации ли-

---

\* Статья подготовлена при поддержке гранта РФФИ № 19-59-52001 МНТ\_а «Торговля, народные верования, искусство и культура на традиционной ксилографической картине Китая из малоисследованных коллекций России и Тайваня».



тературных форм, бытовавших с эпох Сун и Мин (сказ *хуабэнь*, *цыхуа*, пьеса *чуаньци*), в визуальные формы и понять их место в позднецинской массовой культуре. Авторы обнаружили несколько старопечатных изданий о судьбе Бао (Бао-гуне 包公, или Бао Драконовой карте *Баолунту* 包龍圖) в восточном отделе Научной библиотеки Санкт-Петербургского государственного университета, одно из которых снабжено иллюстрациями. Анализ эволюции иллюстраций к повестям о судьбе Бао и их сравнение с народной картиной привели нас к выводу об отсутствии прямых связей между двумя изобразительными жанрами применительно к сюжетам о судьбе Бао. Ознакомление с народными картинами из российских собраний (главным образом из Государственного Эрмитажа) доказывает важную роль традиционной драмы (пекинской оперы) в переработке литературных сюжетов: на народной картине зачастую изображались именно сцены из пьес. Показана важная роль романа Ши Юйкуня «Трое храбрых, пятеро справедливых» (*Саньсяуи* 三俠五義, 1879), вобравшего в себя ранние минские повествования о судьбе Бао. Широкая известность романа подтверждается немалым числом народных картин по его мотивам. На примере пьесы «Избиение императорского халата» (*Да лунпао* 打龍袍), представленной на народной картине, показано, что сюжет пьесы мог быть отличным от сюжета романа. Роман Ши Юйкуня не был единственным источником историй о судьбе Бао, популярностью пользовался также роман Ли Юйтана 李雨堂 «Павильон мириад цветов» (*Ваньхуалоу* 萬花樓), пьеса «Пещера пяти цветов» (*Ухуадун* 五花洞) была заимствована из цинского сборника пьес «Сшитая из лоскутков лисья шуба» (*Чжуйбайцю* 綴白裘). Любовь широкой публики к пьесам с батальными сценами могла давать литераторам стимул к созданию продолжений к романам Ши Юйкуня и Ли Юйтана, и они также отображались на народной картине, подобно сюжетам о воителях, помогавших цинским судьям Ши и Пэну.

*Ключевые слова:* истории о судьбе Бао, книжная иллюстрация, пьеса, народная картина *няньхуа*, русские коллекции, батальные сцены.

Статья поступила в редакцию 23 марта 2021 г.,  
рекомендована к печати 24 июня 2021 г.

#### Контактная информация:

Завидовская Екатерина Александровна — канд. филол. наук; katushaza@yahoo.com

Виноградова Татьяна Игоревна — канд. ист. наук; ptat-vinogradova2008@yandex.ru

Маяцкий Дмитрий Иванович — канд. филол. наук; d.mayatsky@spbu.ru