

HKB

Hochschule der Künste Bern
Haute école des arts de Berne
Bern University of the Arts

Bootleg Opera – The Ehrenreich Collection and the Practice of Private Opera Recording

ONLINE Workshop-Conference of the Bern University of the Arts (HKB)
Wednesday 2 to Friday 4 September 2020



www.hkb-interpretation.ch/bootleg-opera

Program (Draft 08/2020)



Berner Fachhochschule
Haute école spécialisée bernoise
Bern University of Applied Sciences

Wednesday, 2 September 2020

(GMT+2)

- 16.00 HKB welcome (Thomas Gartmann, Martin Skamletz)
- 16.15 Laura Moeckli (Bern University of the Arts HKB)
The Ehrenreich Collection: Virtual Tour and Introduction
Bootlegging practices and identities in the Ehrenreich collection
- 17.15 Eduard Klein (Bern University of Applied Sciences BFH):
“Opera Forever, for Everyone?”
- 18.00 *Break*
- 18.30 Panel **Broadcast Bootlegs in Context(s)**
Chair: Cristina Urchueguía, University of Bern
- Erin Brooks (SUNY Potsdam):
Intimate Collections: Considering Materiality and Identity via
Metropolitan Opera Broadcast Bootlegs
- Olga Manulkina (Saint Petersburg University):
Through the Bootleg Lens: Mariinsky Theatre, 1990s–2010s
- Ferenc János Szabó (Research Centre for the Humanities, Budapest):
Hidden recordings from the Hungarian Radio:
The Babits-Makai Collection
- 20.00 Online discussion in breakout sessions
(1. Klein, 2. Brooks, 3. Manulkina, 4. Szabò)
- 20.30 End of the panel

Thursday, 3 September 2020

- 16.00 Panel ***Collecting - Preserving - Sharing?***
Chair: Kelly Christensen (Stanford University)
- Klaus Pietschmann (Johannes Gutenberg-University, Mainz):
From vinyl to flac: Opera bootlegs as collectables
- Nicholas Melia (University of York):
Preserving *Music Preserved*: 20th century audio archives in the 21st century
- 17.00 **Workshop “Listening to the Ehrenreich recordings 1”**
Discussing and reflecting on the experience of listening to the Ehrenreich recordings.
- 18.00 *Break*
- 18.30 **Workshop (in English and German)** with Frédéric Döhl (Deutsche Nationalbibliothek and Freie Universität Berlin):
Der Zweck heiligt das Mittel? Bootlegs – Forschung – Recht
- 20.00 Online discussion in breakout sessions (1. Pietschmann, 2. Melia, 3. Döhl)
- 20.30 End of the panel

Friday, 4 September 2020

16.00 Panel ***Performance and Listening Practices in Dialogue (Part I)***
Chair: Laura Moeckli (HKB)

Ingela Tägil (Bern University of the Arts HKB):
Fine-Tuning Vocal Studies through Analysis of ‘Live’ Recordings

16.30 **Roundtable and Workshop “Listening to the Ehrenreich recordings 2”**

Discussing a selection of Ehrenreich recordings with Will Crutchfield (conductor, director Teatro Nuovo, New York), Barbara Gentili (Cardiff University), and Lola San Martin (EHESS Paris).

18.00 *Break*

18.30 Panel ***Performance and Listening Practices in Dialogue (Part II)***
Chair: Colleen Renihan (Queen’s University, Kingston)

Georgia Volioti (University of Surrey):
**Learning from recordings as cultural capability
Towards developing listening pedagogies**

Florian Besthorn (LMU, Munich):
**The production and reception context of the controversial Boston
Intolleranza by Luigi Nono**

Esteban Buch (EHESS, Paris):
Repetition and Ritual in Lockdown Listening Practices

20.00 Online discussion in breakout sessions
(1. Tägil, 2. Volioti, 3. Besthorn, 4. Buch)

20.30 Final discussion

21.00 End of the conference

Abstracts

Laura Moeckli (Bern University of the Arts HKB)

Bootlegging practices and identities in the Ehrenreich collection

In typical testimonies of rock concert bootlegging, interviewees describe their motivation for illicit recording as a dedication to the preservation of cultural heritage beyond the hegemony of record companies, concert venues and even artists themselves. Similarly, the gay opera enthusiast Leroy Allan Ehrenreich (1929–2016), whose daytime job as Speechwriter at the New York Stock Exchange enabled him to finance his evening passion as an opera bootlegger, agreed with this viewpoint. As a self-proclaimed “pirate-queen”, belonging to a network of like-minded cosmopolitan bootleggers, he compiled an impressive collection of over 2000 reel-to-reel tapes comprizing private bootleg recordings made between 1965 and 2010 at the major opera venues in New York, as well as broadcast recordings, tapes acquired from others and some rare commercial recordings. After his death, his ‘lifework’ was donated to the Bern University of the Arts HKB with the specific request of making available for research any contents valuable for posterity. Due to its unauthorized and transgressive nature, such bootleg collections pose important questions for research institutions and scholars today, some of which will be considered during this conference.

In this introductory paper, I contextualize this unique collection within the social phenomenon of bootlegging, focusing specifically on those materials illuminating the ‘network’ of bootleg opera collectors actively communicating during this era, before turning to the unique soundscapes documented in the recordings. Specific attributes of these recordings, such as the reverberation of the vocal and instrumental music, the size and acoustics of the stage, as well as the quality of the murmuring, coughing, grunting, shuffling, clapping and shouting noises of audience members, give insight into listener/audience experiences over time. I explore how the distinct sounds of musical experience contained within these bootlegs enrich and enfold our understanding of operatic practices, social networks and audience identities both past and present.

Laura Moeckli is research associate at the Bern University of the Arts HKB, specialized in nineteenth-century opera dramaturgy, performance and reception. In her doctoral thesis she examined recitative and declamation in nineteenth-century German and French language opera (University of Bern, 2015). Her current projects and publications are dedicated to *Reinventing Recitative*, *Carmen Abroad*, *Bootleg Opera*, *Time in Opera* and, beginning in October 2020, “The reception of European comic and mixed opera genres in unified Italy 1870–1885” in conjunction with a new research project of the University of Bern, funded by the Swiss national Science Foundation (2020–2023).

Eduard Klein (Bern University of Applied Sciences BFH)

“Opera Forever, for Everyone?”

One of the projects launched in connection with the Ehrenreich collection, is to develop a concept for making available some of the recordings for experts, scientists and interested citizens. In value-added applications, users should be able to browse, navigate and comment on selected recordings. To achieve this, the recordings would have to be preprocessed and annotated appropriately in advance, i.e. they have to be identified, split into segments and semantically annotated on several levels. Due to the large corpus considered it is tedious to annotate a complete collection manually, hence automation will be explored as a more efficient way towards indexing and exploring large audio collections. Since current auto-segmentation techniques depend more on physical or lower-level audio features than on logical segments, it cannot be expected to fully automate the process of detecting segments on the higher logical level. An automated segmentation process needs initial orientation, so for each opera one or more properly annotated reference recordings would be helpful, which could be created by project members, experts or through crowdsourcing, e.g. using crowdsourcing platforms like zooniverse.org or citizenscience.ch, or labelling services like the Google AI Labeling Service. With a properly annotated recording of a specific opera, it can be expected that identifying segments in other recordings of the same opera within the collection should be possible in a highly automated way, using machine learning techniques and popular programming libraries. It still has to be researched to what extent cover song detection techniques or Dynamic Time Warping (DTW) techniques for detecting similarities between two (temporal) audio sequences are useful for automating the segmentation process. Moreover, it must be researched to what extent existing (RDF) vocabularies for annotation operas, performances, segments, comments etc. are useful for the Ehrenreich Collection context. In this talk, our preliminary research will be presented, open questions will be discussed and input from the participants' side will help to focus the project goals.

Eduard Klein (PhD in Computer Science from the University of Karlsruhe/Germany) is senior lecturer and researcher at the Institute of Public Sector Transformation (IPST) at the Bern University of Applied Sciences, Department of Business. His areas of interest are Business IT, especially (semantic) web technologies, software engineering, data base technologies and (linked) open data. The most recent EC funded projects he is involved in are on smart city innovation and linked data. As a music lover and (amateur) musician, his interests also lie in the use of semantic web technologies for semantic indexing of music collections.

Erin Brooks (SUNY Potsdam): Intimate Collections: Considering Materiality and Identity via Metropolitan Opera Broadcast Bootlegs

Beginning with the 1931 Christmas Day transmission, Metropolitan Opera radio broadcasts quickly became a media phenomenon – by the late 1930s, roughly ten million people listened each weekend. Eighty-nine seasons later, listeners still tune in to opera on Saturday afternoons. Yet despite extensive scholarship on stage

productions, Met radio programs have received little critical attention. My study connects materiality, bootleg recordings, and identity by considering how collection and dissemination of radio broadcasts complicates existent scholarship on operatic listening. The Met began officially releasing Historic Broadcast Recordings in 1974; thus for over forty years, the radio programs typically circulated as bootlegs. Ehrenreich's collection, for example, contains hundreds of broadcasts on reel-to-reel tapes. Such bootlegs elicit a range of crucial questions: where, for example, do these tapes fall on the spectrum of "liveness" versus mediatized performance? How did listening at home – and preserving broadcasts – messily intertwine the "public space" of the opera house with listeners' domestic spaces? And as consumers and friends circulated bootlegs along unofficial channels, what might analyzing such "user-driven, decentralized networks of creative exchange" (Bohlman 2017) add to preexistent work on operatic listening subjectivities by scholars such as Mitchell Morris? Drawing on archival documents, bootleg collections, memoirs, and press coverage, I incorporate theory from voice studies, work on gender, sexuality, and race, and scholarship connecting intimacy and material culture. Ultimately, I demonstrate that studying bootleg copies of Met broadcasts not only offers a new analytical lens on a long-lived media product, but also uniquely illuminates ties between music and identity.

Erin Brooks is Assistant Professor of Music History at the State University of New York-Potsdam. She specializes in dramatic musics, transnational reception, sound studies, and interconnections between opera and film. Additional research areas include trauma studies, space and musical mapping, and gender and sexuality. Erin's publications range from studies of the operas of Camille Saint-Saëns to the films of Sarah Bernhardt to the semiotics of film screenings in classical music venues. Her current projects cover music on silent film sets, sound and trauma in mid-century American medical contexts, and the performance histories of Puccini's *Tosca*.

Olga Manulkina (Saint Petersburg University):

Through the Bootleg Lens: Mariinsky Theatre, 1990s–2010s

Soviet opera fans were not prepared for bootlegging; portable Soviet tape recorders modeled after the Western ones appeared in the shops late and were expensive. The happy owners of these devices (who could buy it for the price equivalent of two months' salary of an engineer or had an opportunity to bring such a tape recorder from abroad) most probably were not obsessed with opera.

Bootleg opera in Russia, therefore, is a rather recent phenomenon, unlike piracy that was widespread before Perestroika. Even professional musicians and music students – even in Leningrad – did not have access to legitimate opera video recordings made in the West (neither in the shops nor in the libraries), so the only way of keeping up with contemporary opera processes was to copy the videotapes brought from abroad and to record the opera broadcasted on television.

This paper will focus on bootlegging at Mariinsky Theatre in St Petersburg, that coincided with Valery Gergiev's era and will discuss the following questions: what alternative story do these recordings tell about the three decades (considering both bootleg versions of the productions available in official recordings and the

bootlegged repertoire otherwise not available), about Russian singers and their careers, conductors and directors; and how do they function as a source for understanding modern Russian “opera mania” and general opera audience (tastes and choices, opera rituals and tourist attractions, experts and novices, adepts of traditional opera and staging and of “director’s opera”).

Olga Manulkina is an Associate Professor at the St Petersburg University and at the St Petersburg State Conservatory; a founding director of the Master program “Music criticism”; founding editor-in-chief (2009–2018) of the journal *Opera Musicologica*; Fulbright alumna (2002). She was a music critic at the Russian federal newspaper *Kommersant* and *Afisha* magazine, a member of the jury of Russian National Theatre Prize “Golden Mask”. Manulkina is the author of the book *From Ives to Adams: American Music of the Twentieth Century* (2010), numerous articles and over 500 reviews and previews; she compiled and edited with Pavel Gershenzon *A Century of Le Sacre: A Century of Modernism* (Bolshoi theatre, 2013) and *New Russian Music Criticism. 1993–2003* (2015).

Ferenc János Szabó (Research Centre for the Humanities, Budapest):

Hidden recordings from the Hungarian Radio: The Babits-Makai Collection

It was very fashionable for admirers of popular performers to record radio broadcasts using a tape-recorder at home in the post-1950s era in Hungary. Even today several “home-recorded” broadcast recordings appear on YouTube or in the fan clubs on social media. However, home recording was available before World War II as well; several Hungarian acousticians experimented with home recording and private studio recordings in the late 1920s, 1930s and 1940s. Ilona Tanner (or with her pen name, Sophie Török), the wife of the excellent Hungarian poet Mihály Babits, was an enthusiast of the piano playing of Béla Bartók and entrusted a Hungarian acoustician, István Makai, with the task of recording the live-transmissions of concerts by Bartók. Makai recorded many excerpts from the broadcasts of the Hungarian Radio, providing an inexhaustible repository of sources not only for the audio research, but also for musicology and history. His Bartók recordings were published in 1981, but some further valuable recordings were part only of the collective memory up to now, because, while the heritage of Sophie Török has been kept at the National Széchényi Library for a long time, István Makai’s recordings have only been recently acquired by the National Library, and are still under processing.

In my presentation I will give an overview of the *home recording* culture of the 1930s in Hungary, and then I will investigate the Babits-Makai Collection from two perspectives. I intend to reveal its history as it is documented on the recordings themselves and in other sources, and I will demonstrate several chronological phases of research interest connected to this collection.

Ferenc János Szabó, pianist and musicologist, studied piano at the Ferenc Liszt Music Academy (Budapest) and chamber music at Kunstuniversität Graz. He has doctor’s degrees DLA as pianist (2012) and PhD in musicology (2018). As a pianist, he won several prizes at international chamber music competitions. Since March 2013, he has been senior lecturer and coach at the Liszt Academy. Since September

2011, he has worked at the Institute for Musicology, his research fields are the history of Hungarian sound recordings and performance practice. He won postdoctoral scholarships at the Liszt Academy (2013) and the Hungarian Academy of Sciences (2013–2015). Recently he conducted research in London as the holder of the Edison Fellowship of the British Library and the Richard Taylor Bursary of the City of London Phonograph and Gramophone Society.

Klaus Pietschmann (Johannes Gutenberg-University, Mainz):

From vinyl to flac: Opera bootlegs as collectables

The opera bootleg has gone through several media revolutions in its long history and has always proved to be extremely adaptable, whether on vinyl, tape, audio cassette, CD, MD, DAT or, more recently, in the diverse storage formats of digital audio files. Already in the early days, very different types of recording phenomena co-existed, ranging from recordings that were minimalist in terms of equipment and sound quality (often the case for the labels UORC, ANNA or Golden Age of Opera, for example) to editorially and technically fine-tuned editions (for example in some sets of the labels MRF or VOCE). The fact that the interests and preferences of opera bootleg collectors continue to vary widely in the present day is evidenced by the discussions held in various online forums. The collection cultures and practices emerging in this context are difficult to grasp and just as difficult to assess in terms of scientific relevance. Based on an initial attempt to classify different types of opera bootlegs, the paper will primarily develop questions and discussion impulses that attempt to outline a delicate field of research.

Klaus Pietschmann is Professor of Musicology at the Johannes Gutenberg-University of Mainz. His principal research interests are the social, institutional, and theological aspects of sacred music in late-medieval and early modern Italy and Germany, in particular the papal chapel in the sixteenth century; music iconography; and eighteenth- and nineteenth-century opera. Recent publications include *(Re-)Constructing Renaissance Music: Perspectives from the Digital Humanities and Music Theory* (2020: <http://nbn-resolving.de/urn:nbn:de:hbz:6-90199709017>), *Intermedialität von Bild und Musik* (2017, together with Elisabeth Oy-Marra, Gregor Wedekind, Martin Zenck), *Musik und Theater in der Schweiz des 19. Jahrhunderts. Das Berner Hôtel de Musique und sein Umfeld* (2015, together with Fabian Kolb).

Nicholas Melia (University of York):

Preserving *Music Preserved*: 20th century audio archives in the 21st century

The Music Preserved charity, which exists to preserve recordings of public performances of classical music, emerged from musician Jon Tolansky's desire to safeguard an extensive and at the time illicit collection of off-air broadcast recordings damaged in a lightning strike at his home in 1979.

Following a government order permitting Tolansky's recordings to be maintained as an archive without infringement of copyright, the Music Preserved archive expanded

significantly and today numbers 18,000+ items and 30,000 recordings across 15 collections. It also includes many important on-site and 'covert' performance and rehearsal recordings.

The archive documents a century of music broadcasting, as well as the complex collecting and trading behaviours of British music luminaries such as Patrick Saul, founder of the British Institute of Recorded Sound and founder member of IASA, and George Lascelles, Earl of Harewood and former director of the Royal Opera House and ENO, alongside many lesser-known yet dedicated individuals who continued to record off-air to 1/4" tape into the twenty-first century.

In the context of IASA's estimate that traditional recording formats may become broadly inaccessible within the next decade due to the ever decreasing availability of expertise and equipment, this paper examines the unique challenges presented in managing, preserving, and advocating for the Music Preserved archive. It examines the tensions at play between the need to maintain the provenance of disparate and sometimes indiscriminate collecting ethics, and the archival obligation to preserve the unique, often with limited resources.

Nicholas Melia is an archivist at the Borthwick Institute for Archives at the University of York. He specializes in audio-visual archives, and is currently cataloguing the papers of composers Trevor Wishart and Richard Orton, the archive of the groundbreaking Music in the Secondary School Curriculum education project, and the Music Preserved archive of classical music broadcast recordings. He obtained a doctorate in composition at the University of East Anglia in 2005 under Simon Waters and Jonathan Impett; his musicological interests primarily concern contemporary music and philosophy, and he has written and translated work on and by the Wandelweiser composers.

Frédéric Döhl (Deutschen Nationalbibliothek and Freie Universität Berlin):

Workshop: Der Zweck heiligt das Mittel? Bootlegs – Forschung – Recht

Der Workshop stellt aus forschungsethischer, wissenschaftspraktischer und rechtsdogmatischer Sicht die Frage nach den Möglichkeiten, in ihrem Ursprung illegale Ressourcen wie Bootlegs, Plagiate, Leads etc. in Forschung und Lehre für ausschließlich wissenschaftliche Zwecke zu verwenden, eine erhebliche Herausforderung im Kontext der Gegenwartsforschung in den Künsten, in denen z. B. minimalinvasiv hergestellte, qualitativ hochwertige, aber selten genehmigte Handyvideos performativer Praktiken eine zentrale, oftmals über das Internet unkompliziert distribuierte Primärquelle geworden sind. Es findet schlicht statt. Stößt aber an Grenzen, sobald es öffentlich wird, was forschungsseitig notwendige Schritte wie wissenschaftliches Sammeln, Erschließen und Edieren oder auch nur digitale Zitationsarchive zur Sicherung der Referenzierbarkeit verhindert. Gleichzeitig stehen diese Eingriffe in die Wissenschaftsfreiheit regelmäßig Eingriffen in das gleichrangige Grundrecht auf Eigentumsfreiheit gegenüber, bisweilen auch in weitere Rechte wie Persönlichkeitsrechte. Der Workshop skizziert einleitend das Problem, verortet es forschungspolitisch und rechtlich und möchte dann im gemeinsamen Gespräch das Maß und die Diversität dieser Herausforderung für die Gegenwartsforschung näher bestimmen und nach möglichen Lösungen fragen.

Frédéric Döhl, PD Dr. phil. Ass.iur., ist Referent der Generaldirektion der Deutschen Nationalbibliothek und Privatdozent für Musikwissenschaft am Institut für Theaterwissenschaft der Freien Universität Berlin. Er arbeitet derzeit viel zu Bearbeitungsrecht, Digital Humanities und Gedächtnisinstitutionen sowie Musiktheater pro-1990.

Ingela Tägil (Bern University of the Arts HKB):

Fine-Tuning Vocal Studies through Analysis of ‘Live’ Recordings

This paper will show how the materials of the Ehrenreich collection contain unparalleled resources for analyzing recorded opera voices active in New York between 1965 and 2016. As the Ehrenreich recordings offer largely complete and unedited footage of performances from several major opera institutions including New York City Opera, American Opera Society and Opera Orchestra, they present an invaluable source of recorded opera performance during this era.

This unique material is interesting to me as voice researcher in many aspects, two of which I will address here: First, some of the young singers who made big careers in the second half of the twentieth century are ‘recorded live in this collection very early in their careers, sometimes for the first time. This gives new insight into the sound development of ‘great voices’ in their early phases. Furthermore, some of the singers, such as Beverly Sills, are frequently recorded under similar and largely unedited conditions, providing a better overview of the diva’s vocal development over several decades.

A second approach I’m interested in is to consider the impact of historically informed performance practice on the vocal production of opera performances from approximately the 1980s. A case study was done last year which experimented with analysis possibilities of how to investigate the impact of early music trends in one of the most well-known and extreme coloratura roles, The Queen of the Night. The Ehrenreich collection includes 13 recordings of *Die Zauberflöte* between 1968 and 2003, offering an ideal sample to investigate some of the tendencies changing in voice aesthetics and vocal techniques during the late twentieth century. The case study experimented with several analytical methods for approaching recorded opera voices. Working with both quantitative and qualitative analysis methods, measurable parameters such as tempi, tempi deviations, voice dynamics, intonation, portamentos, tone onset, vibrato and formant frequencies were brought into consideration. This paper presents some of the results and perspectives gained through this project.

Ingela Tägil from Sweden is specialized on 19th-century opera voice techniques. In 2013, after ten years singing career as a coloratura soprano, she received her doctoral degree with a thesis on the voice of the Swedish opera singer Jenny Lind (1820–1887). 2015–2018 Tägil worked on an international post-doc project, founded by the Swedish Science Council, at the Bern University of Arts HKB, investigating Manuel Garcia’s (1805–1906) vocal techniques. In April 2020 she published a biography of Jenny Lind. Tägil is part of the group investigating the Ehrenreich collection at HKB.

Roundtable and Workshop “Listening to the Ehrenreich recordings 2”

Discussing a selection of Ehrenreich recordings with Will Crutchfield (conductor, director Teatro Nuovo, New York), Barbara Gentili (Cardiff University), and Lola San Martín (EHESS Paris).

Will Crutchfield is the Artistic Director of Teatro Nuovo, an opera troupe that performs 19th-century Italian works on period instruments. Since its founding in 2017 Teatro Nuovo has presented operas of Rossini, Donizetti, Mayr, and Bellini, and has been the first group worldwide to perform full-scale Romantic operas with period-style musical direction (violin and keyboard) instead of a stand-up conductor. Previously Crutchfield held conducting posts with the Opera de Colombia (Bogotá), the Polish National Opera (Warsaw), and the Caramoor Music Festival (New York), while appearing as guest with the Rossini Opera Festival (Pesaro), the Washington National Opera, the Warsaw Philharmonic Orchestra and many others. He has also written on musical topics for *The Grove Dictionaries*, *The New Yorker*, *The New York Times*, and various academic journals.

Barbara Gentili is Leverhulme Early Career Fellow at Cardiff University. Her research interests focus on the cultural history of Italian opera and operatic singing in the decades spanning the turn of the twentieth century; the cultural, technological and commercial impacts of early recordings; music autoethnography. Her academic work is informed by her own performance practice as a stage and concert soprano. Forthcoming publications include articles for *Music & Letters* and the *Journal of the Royal Musical Association*, and a chapter for *The Routledge Companion to Autoethnography and Self-Reflexivity in Music Studies*. She writes for *The Spectator*, *Opera Magazine*, *Il giornale della musica* and *OperaClick*.

Lola San Martín Arbide is a musicologist and research fellow at the EHESS in Paris. Her work focuses on the cultural study of music since 1875 to the present. Recent publications include book chapters on the Spanish reception of Bizet’s *Carmen* in the wake of peripheral regionalisms (1845–1936), and on the production of this opera in the context of contemporary feminism. Other research interests include music and the middlebrow, Debussy, music and urban nostalgia, film music, intermedia experimentation, and cultural geography, a subject on which she is writing a book exploring Parisian musical landscapes during the Third Republic.

Georgia Volioti (University of Surrey):

Learning from recordings as cultural capability: Towards developing listening pedagogies

Following the recent surge of interest in the study of sound recordings as performative historical texts, some scholars have drawn attention to the need to listen to this aural evidence, especially to early recordings, with the intention to challenge critically prevailing ideologies and practices of modern performance (Clarke, 2012; Leech-Wilkinson, 2016; Barth, 2018). Although it would seem that we now occupy an enviable position to relish, preserve, and learn from this immense musical heritage, an impasse still exists. Listening pedagogies to inspire and inform

musicians are lagging behind. This impasse is further compounded by the problematic listening attitudes towards classical music: the privileging of a pristine 'end-product' (a note-perfect performance, a literalist rendition of the score, or a clean-sounding recording) and consequently the privileging of a reproduction paradigm for performance. In this paper, taking a 'capabilities approach to culture' (Wilson, 2017), I consider learning (from/with recordings) as a process of actively realizing and (co)creating our own version of culture. Rather than advocating a specific approach to performance interpretation, via an eclectic rendering of the historical aural evidence, I argue for the need to firmly situate listening to this recorded heritage within constructivist pedagogies that aim to stimulate and empower the learner. By bringing empirical evidence, about how classical musicians listen to recordings, in dialogue with theories of musical learning and development, I discuss some of the implications for education. I conclude by delineating a broader model of listening pedagogies as cultural capability pointing out the need for the development of evidence-based approaches not only to chart the sonic past but also to instigate creative practice and learning from it.

Georgia Volioti is a Lecturer in Music at the University of Surrey where she is currently Director of the Music BMus Programme. Her research interests embrace performance studies, empirical musicology, music psychology, music education, historical and cultural musicology. She has published on the cultural reception, historiography, criticism, and analysis of musical performance, issues of performance practice, cultural responses to the legacy of recordings, the media and materiality of recording technology, expressive gesture in performance, visual culture and music, listening practices and musicians' self-regulated learning. Her research has been published in leading peer-reviewed journals and edited volumes and has been presented at numerous international conferences.

Florian Besthorn (LMU, Munich):

The production and reception context of the controversial Boston *Intolleranza* by Luigi Nono

Unfortunately, Luigi Nono's *Intolleranza* is still up to date: His first work for the opera stage addresses intolerance, inequities, and the violation of human dignity. However, the world premiere (La Fenice, Venice 1961) was disrupted by rowdy (neo-)fascists and became history-charged. Although there were only two performances, it was discussed highly controversially in the newspapers and specialist periodicals (not only in Italy) for over two years. Equally, the Boston production by Sarah Caldwell had a huge media response. It is surprising that we know a lot about the circumstances of the first (and last) stage production of Nono's *Intolleranza* in the USA, but almost nothing about the English version of the work. Based on interviews with Josef Svoboda (scene designer of the première and the production in Boston) the staging could particularly be 'reconstructed', although admittedly Nono enforced various changes just two days before the first night, on February 21, 1965 at The Back Bay Theatre. Interestingly, Svoboda retrospectively called the production "the biggest, most complicated and best production I have ever done. It has not been surpassed since", whereas Nono gave vent to his anger in the so called "Letter from Los

Angeles”, in which he attacked well-nigh the complete production team and their performance.

Fortunately, the Ehrenreich Collection contains a recording of the production in Boston, conducted by Bruno Maderna, who was also the performer of the world premiere. Based on this recording I will attempt to ‘reconstruct’ the English libretto of *Intolleranza*, which is currently not available – even at the publishing house.

Programme notes and the libretto were never printed; this was explained by lack of time. I will also look at which texts were sung in Boston and if there were censored passages (as suggested by Nono) or not. In addition, I want to analyze the recording of the Ehrenreich Collection with respect to reception sounds, considering the reactions of the audience as heard on the recording. With this paper I aim to bring additional insight into the production and reception context of the controversial Boston *Intolleranza*.

Florian Henri Besthorn received his doctorate with a study on the ‘musical body’ in the works by Jörg Widmann at the University of Basel. He has also published on works by Henze, Kagel, Schnebel, Sciarrino or Stravinskij and on conductors in the 20th century. He is currently working on a research project on Roman Haubenstock-Ramati at the Ludwig Maximilian University of Munich.

Esteban Buch (EHESS Paris):

Repetition and Ritual in Lockdown Listening Practices

Repetition is crucial in music pleasures, at the level of compositional techniques, performative rituals, and listening practices. New sound technologies usually improve the listening experience of old records and produce better records of old pieces, at least as much as they bring into existence unheard-of sounds and music. Now, the current pandemic brutally disrupted music practices, thus arguably favoring the contrary of repetition. On the other hand, the absence of live music stimulated the circulation of previously available recordings, thus arguably filling the void of new events with memories of former events. This talk will address some temporal paradoxes inherent to the experience and memory of music in these troubled times, by taking as a case study recordings of Beethoven’s *Fidelio*, a work whose very topic is the experience of confinement and the moral issues that surround it.

Esteban Buch (Buenos Aires, 1963) is professor of music history at the Ecole des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales (EHESS) in Paris. A specialist of the relationship between music and politics, he is the author of *Trauermarsch. L’Orchestre de Paris dans l’Argentine de la dictature* (Seuil, 2016), *Le cas Schönberg. Naissance de l’avant-garde musicale* (Gallimard, 2006), and *Beethoven’s Ninth. A Political History* (The University of Chicago Press, 2003), among other books. He has also written opera librettos, including Sebastian Rivas’s *Aliados. Un opéra du temps réel* (2013).